

Value for Money And Policy Review

Bovine Tuberculosis
Eradication Programme
(1996-2006)

Contents	Page
Executive Summary	x
Glossary of Abbreviations and Terms	xxv
Chapter 1: Introduction	1
1.1 Background to the review	2
1.2 The Department of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food	5
1.3 Agriculture and the Irish economy	6
1.4 Bovine tuberculosis	7
1.5 The Bovine Tuberculosis Eradication Programme (BTEP)	8
1.6 Format of the report	21
Chapter 2: Programme Objectives	25
2.1 Introduction	26
2.2 The need for a bovine TB eradication programme	26
2.3 Programme objectives	32
2.4 Compatibility of the Programme objectives with government strategy	34
2.5 Key findings	41
2.6 Conclusions	42
2.7 Recommendations	43
Chapter 3: Justification for public intervention	47
3.1 Introduction	48
3.2 The rationale for public intervention in the BTEP	48
3.3 The extent of public intervention in the Programme	53
3.4 Key Findings	58
3.5 Conclusions	59
3.6 Recommendations	60

Chapter 4: Programme outputs	62
4.1 Introduction	63
4.2 Compensation	65
4.3 Tuberculin testing	69
4.4 Wildlife control	73
4.5 Research	75
4.6 Reactor Collection Service	79
4.7 Information and Communication Technologies (ICT)	80
4.8 <i>Post-mortem</i> surveillance	82
4.9 Key findings	85
4.10 Conclusions	87
Chapter 5: Efficiency (Costs and resource allocation)	90
5.1 Introduction	91
5.2 Aggregate expenditure on TB and brucellosis eradication	91
5.3 Gross expenditure on TB eradication	92
5.4 Net expenditure on TB eradication	92
5.5 Resource allocation	94
5.6 Compensation	96
5.7 Tuberculin testing	103
5.8 The Wildlife Unit	110
5.9 Research	112
5.10 Reactor Collection Service	113
5.11 Supplies / Capital Assets	115
5.12 Information and Communication Technologies (ICT)	116
5.13 <i>Post-mortem</i> surveillance	119
5.14 Staff costs	119
5.15 Key findings	127
5.16 Conclusions	130
5.17 Recommendations	131

Chapter 6: Effectiveness	140
6.1 Introduction	141
6.2 Compensation	142
6.3 Disease surveillance and control	147
6.4 Wildlife control measures	161
6.5 Research and technology	168
6.6 Reactor Collection Service	170
6.7 <i>Post-mortem</i> surveillance	171
6.8 Programme impact	174
6.9 Continued relevance	177
6.10 Key findings	179
6.11 Conclusions	183
6.12 Recommendations	185
Chapter 7: Performance measurement	188
7.1 Introduction	189
7.2 Result and impact indicators	190
7.3 Compensation indicators	191
7.4 Field surveillance and control indicators	192
7.5 Wildlife control indicators	195
7.6 Research indicators	197
7.7 Reactor collection indicators	198
7.8 <i>Post-mortem</i> surveillance indicators	198
7.9 Key findings	200
7.10 Conclusions	201
7.11 Recommendations	202
Chapter 8: Alternative approaches	203
8.1 Introduction	204
8.2 Enhanced disease control for high-risk herds	204
8.3 Use of lay TB testers	211
8.4 Reactor Collection Service	217
8.5 Field visits	219

8.6 Collection of Bovine Disease Levies	220
8.7 Key findings	221
8.8 Conclusions	223
8.9 Recommendations	224
Chapter 9: Conclusions and recommendations	226
9.1 Introduction	227
9.2 Programme rationale	227
9.3 Programme efficiency	229
9.4 Programme effectiveness	232
9.5 Continuing relevance	236
9.6 Summary of recommendations	237
Appendices and References	
Appendix A: Methodology	-1-
Appendix B: Literature Review	-12-
Appendices C-L: Various	-40-
References	-64-
List of Tables	vii
List of Figures	viii

Tables	Page
Table 1.1 Composition of Steering Committee	2
Table 2.1 Contribution of agriculture to the Irish economy	44
Table 2.2 Imports and exports of meat of bovine animals	44
Table 2.3 Irish beef exports to EU markets (1996-2006)	45
Table 4.1 Outputs of the compensation schemes (1996-2006)	88
Table 4.2 Outputs of the tuberculin testing programme (1996-2006)	89
Table 4.3 Selected outputs of the Veterinary Laboratory Services (1996-2006)	89
Table 5.1 Gross expenditure on the TB and BR programmes (1996-2006)	132
Table 5.2 Net expenditure on the TB Programme (1996-2006)	132
Table 5.3 Bovine Disease Levies (TB only) by source (1996-2006)	133
Table 5.4 Programme expenditure by category (1996-2006)	133
Table 5.5 Compensation by category (1996-2006)	134
Table 5.6 Compensation and compensation per reactor (1996-2006)	135
Table 5.7 Indirect compensation by category (1996-2006)	136
Table 5.8 Aggregate and unit cost of tuberculin testing (1996-2006)	136
Table 5.9 Exchequer impact of the 1995 agreement	137
Table 5.10 Aggregate and unit cost of tuberculin (1996-2006)	137
Table 5.11 Aggregate and unit cost of Reactor Collection Service (1996-2006)	137
Table 5.12 Supplies and capital assets (1996-2006)	138
Table 5.13 Programme and staff costs for selected years	138
Table 6.1 TB episode classification, Co. Monaghan (2000-2006)	187
Table 6.2 Selected TB data, Co. Monaghan (1996-2006)	187

Figures	Page
Figure 1.1 Programme Logic Model, evaluation questions and chapter layout	22
Figure 2.1 Net exports of Irish beef and cattle by destination	27
Figure 2.2 Strategy for the eradication of bovine TB, 1991	33
Figure 4.1 Programme Logic Model and the Bovine TB Eradication Programme	64
Figure 4.2 Animal TB tests and cattle population (1996-2006)	72
Figure 4.3 Distribution of test output by test type (1996-2006)	72
Figure 4.4 Areas of the country with highest levels of TB in cattle	74
Figure 4.5 Badger vaccine development programme	78
Figure 4.6 IFN- γ animal test output (1996-2006)	79
Figure 4.7 Cattle slaughterings and cattle population (1996-2006)	84
Figure 5.1 Programme expenditure by category (1996-2006)	95
Figure 5.2 Components of reactor value	98
Figure 5.3 Gross programme and staff expenditure	125
Figure 6.1 Income Supplement recipient herds (threshold analysis)	145
Figure 6.2 Income Supplement recipient herds (period analysis)	145
Figure 6.3 Hardship Grant recipient herds (stocking levels analysis)	147
Figure 6.4 Annual reactor numbers (1959-2006)	148
Figure 6.5 Annual reactor numbers and linear trendline (1988-2006)	149
Figure 6.6 Herd incidence, APT and linear trendlines (1988-2006)	150
Figure 6.7 Reactors and 5-year Exponential Moving Average (1988-2006)	152
Figure 6.8 Herd incidence and 5-year Exponential Moving Average (1988-2006)	152
Figure 6.9 APT and 5-year Exponential Moving Average (1988-2006)	153
Figure 6.10 International comparisons of APT and Herd Incidence (1996-2006)	154
Figure 6.11 Classification of TB test types (2006)	157

Figure 6.12 TB expenditure (gross) and TB reactors (1996-2006)	158
Figure 6.13 Cattle-cattle, badger-badger and badger-cattle disease cycles	162
Figure 6.14 Advances in scientific knowledge and policy initiatives	170
Figure 7.1 Components of effectiveness	190